Towards A Systematic Analysis of Philippine Folktales

Francisco Demetrio, S.J.*

> **The author proposes a more systematic study of Philippine folktales. First of all, he says, folklorists must begin to collect selectively. Second, they must specialize so that the work is divided among scholars in the field. Third, the collectors should analyze the folktales, using both the genetico-historical method and the structural method. Then these folktales must be supplied with English titles and synopsis, and translated into idiomatic English. Finally, the folktales should be published and made available to international scholars and stored in our archives.**

It is a fact that until recently, the science of folkloristics has been stagnant and sterile the world over. Folklorists have been without adequate conceptual tools which are flexible but solid enough for universal applicability. I refer, particularly, to the concepts of motif and plot which have been so dear to folklorists for many years, but whose adequacy as basic tools for analysis have never been put to the test until Vladimir Propp did it in 1928 with the publication of **The Morphopology of the Folktale** (Indiana, 1928). But Propp's methodology took long before it was generally accepted by scholars like Roman Jakobson, Kenneth Pike, Stender-Petersen, Levi-Strauss, Clyde Kluckholn and Alan Dundes.

A close analysis of folklore in general, and of folktale in particular, presupposes necessarily a corpus or body of materials to work with.

* Fr. Demetrio, S.J., is the curator, Folklore Museum, Xavier University, Cagayan de Oro. He got his Ph.D. in folklore and comparative religion from the University of California, Los Angeles, 1968.

Everyone who is in any way conversant with the folktale scholarship in this country cannot miss the fact that there is already a considerable amount of collected materials for analysis.

Collections of Folktales

We have been singularly blessed with published as well as unpublished collections of tales. Both the Christian peoples of the lowlands as well as the so-called cultural minorities, who are generally non-Christian, are well represented in these collections. The most outstanding of the published collections on Filipino folktales was Dean S. Fansler's **Filipino Popular Tales**, first published in 1918, and re-published in 1965. There are about 178 tales in this volume, and the tales are copiously annotated. We know from a later article of Dr. Fansler[1] that these 178 tales are but a fragment of a vaster collection numbering some 4,000 tales, "current and popular among the native inhabitants. . . ." The whereabouts of this vast collection is to date unknown. But there has been avid interest on the part of many folklorists to recover the tales from the green field, if not from dusty library tomes.

Mention must be made of Ma. Delia Coronel's **Stories and Legends from Filipino Folklore** first published in **Unitas**[2], later on enlarged and published as a separate volume. Only recently, F. Landa Jocano came out with his **Outline of Philippine Mythology** (Manila, 1969), which is a lively collection of Philippine myths and legends. I must not omit mention of Dr. Maximo Ramos, who has published much on Philippine folktales especially oriented towards the lower grades.

On the more scholarly level, Donn V. Hart and Hariett C. Hart have done some reconstruction and analysis of a Philippine myth cycle, "Maka-andog: A Reconstructed Myth from Eastern Samar, Philippines."[3] They have also written "Cinderella in the Eastern Bisayas: With a Summary of the Philippine Folktale,"[4] and "A Philippine Version of "The Two Brothers and the Dragon Slayer's Tale."[5]

There are considerble collections still unpublished. So it is quite obvious from this very incomplete listing that a large **corpus** of collected materials is available for scholars in Philippine folktale.

---

[1] Philippine Magazine (May, 1937).

[2] Vol. 39 (December, 1966).

[3] **American Journal of Folklore**, Vol. 79.

[4] **Ibid.**, pp. 307-337.

[5] **Western Folklore**, Vol. 29 (October, 1960), pp. 265-267.

Still Untapped Resources

But what is also perfectly obvious in regard to this vast material is that only very little effort has been expended on the analysis, description and classification of these tales. What is true of the folktale is just as true of the other genre of folklore. Rudolf Rahmann, SVD, and Jose Kuizon have done a study on "Animal Horns and Similar Motifs in Filipino, Eurasian and American-Indian Folklore."[6] Beyer, much earlier, had studied the "Origin Myths among the Mountain Peoples of the Philippines."[7]

The Harts, as mentioned already, have done work on Samar and Leyte tales. My own researches have led me to study the ancient myths of death ("Death: Its Origin and Related Beliefs Among the Early Filipinos."),[8] as well as the "Creative Myths among the Early Filipinos."[9] Maximo Ramos has done the world of Filipino scholarship a service by his doctoral dissertation on Philippine beliefs in the creatures of lower mythology (U.P. Diliman, 1964). This is not, however, a research on the folktale.

A. Arsenio Manuel's opus on the **Maiden of the Buhong Sky,** and his other work on the **Agyu** are an excellent examples of mature scholarship and professional competence. We might mention also Prof. Leopoldo Yabes' work on the **Life of Lam-ang** published a couple of years earlier. Damiana Eugenio's excellent study of Philippine corridos[10] as well as her more recent publication on Philippine proverbs are milestones in scholarship. There may be one more or other isolated publication by some Philippine scholar on a single tale or a group of Philippine folktales. But if you compare the work in analysis with the volume of the material to be analyzed, one must admit that our analytical output, to date, has been quite minimal.

Division of Paper

This paper is divided into the following parts: (1) A brief survey of the traditional methodology of folklore analysis which may be described as genetico-historical, static and stomistic, centered around the

---

[6] **Asian Studies** (Tokyo, 1965).

[7] **Philippine Journal of Science,** Vol. 8, pp. 85-118, Sec. D, No. 2 (April, 1913).

[8] **Philippine Studies,** Vol. 14 (July, 1966), pp. 355-395.

[9] **Asian Folklore Studies,** Vol. 27, No. 1 (Tokyo, 1968), pp. 40-80.

[10] **Awit and Korido: A Study of Fifty Philippine Metrical Romances in Relation to Their Sources and Analogues,** Vol. 1 and 2 (UCLA, doctoral thesis, 1965).

content of the folktale with its motif and plots; (2) An exposition of the more modern method of folktale analysis which may be further described as structural, dynamic and holistic, with the center of attention not the content but the form of the folktale; (3) A sampling of the traditional and modern methods of analysis; (4) Suggestions as to how we might begin a scientific and systematic analysis of the vast corpus of Philippine folktales.

Part I: The Traditional Method of Analysis

Brief History of Folklore (Folktale) Scholarship

It was William Thoms who made current the term folklore in 1846[11]. But the beginnings of folktale scholarship marks back to the Grim Brothers (Wilhelm and Jakob, 1830-1860) who formulated their famous theory that the Western folktales, particularly those of the Germans, were detritus, that is, shavings or remnants, of early Indo-Germanic myths.

Theodore Benfey (1860) came forward with his theory of the pan-Indian origin of the folktales of Europe, claiming that the tales were brought to the West from India at chronologically verifiable times, such as the Persian Wars, the Conquest of Alexander the Great and the Hellenistic period, the rise of Islam, the Mongol invasion, and the Crusades. He was followed soon after by the English Anthropological School (Lang, Frazer, Maccullock, Hartland, 1860-1900) which maintained that folktales originate spontaneously among all primitive peoples both in the West and in the East.

All these earlier theories were concerned one way or the other more with the origins of the folktale rather than with the folktale itself. As scholarship became more sophisticated, they were found to be inadequate and were rightly laid aside.

Beginnings of Scientific Analysis

Kaarle Krohn, a Finnish scholar (1860), was the first to begin what one might term the scientific study of the folktale when he focused his investigation on the tale itself. He trained his mental acumen on a group of animal tales, and his aim was to establish first, their Ur-form, or their original form, their birthplace, and the paths which they had traversed as they migrated over the world. He founded the so-called

---

11 CF. The Athenaeum, No. 982 (August 22, 1846), pp. 862-863.

Finnish School which gradually developed the justly famous historical geographical method under Krohn's most able disciple, Antti Aarne. As mentioned above, the aim of this School was to establish the Ur-form or the archetype of the tale from both the oral and the literary versions. It was historical because it catalogued the written or literary versions in chronological order, while it catalogued the folk or oral versions in geographical sequence. Krohn was insistent that a folktale is one which comes from "the people."

Afterwards, other scholars like Carl von Sydow, the famous Swedish scholar, straightened out and honed the insights of his predecessors. Sydow claimed that neither folklore nor the folktale comes from the people as a whole. For within a given geographical unit, only a very few are tradition bearers. And even among the tradition bearers many are passive, and the so-called active tradition bearers are relatively small in number. He further taught that various traditions are not shared by the people in general. In fact, each tradition is adopted to a particular social group. Thus the traditions of market vendors, of fisherfolk, of farmerfolk, of immigrants, of masons and other craftsmen are quite different from one another. He taught, besides, the theory of **eiko-types** which, translated in modern anthropological terms, simply means the acculturation of the folktale, either as a whole or in its parts: actors, items, incidents. Thus the villains among the various parts of the world could be a giant, a Moor, or the devil, depending on the cultural context in which a tale has rooted itself. Thus in determining the origin, development and spread of the tales, all these factors should be considered. This was a very useful and important insight for which future folklorists must be forever thankful.

More Advances in Folklore Analysis

Out of the Finnish School have come forth scholars of great eminence. At a time when folktale scholarship was very low in conceptual tools for classification, von Sydow proposed during the Paris Congress in 1937 the adoption of categories for classifying the folktale. His categories are:

1) **fable animale,** i.e., a one-episodic animal tale;

2) **joculat,** or one-episodic jest;

3) **fabulat,** or legends. These may be either **belief fabulates,** which are associated with customs and beliefs (ghost stories), or **person fabulates,** which are stories of definitely named persons like Don Pablo Ma-

Study of Fifty Philippine Metrical Romances in Relation to Their Sources and Analogues.[13]

This scholarly activity on an international scale has brought about greater interchange among scholars of various nationalities, thus paving the way to better understanding and consortium.

The second great contribution of the Finnish School to folktale scholarship is the six-volume monument to Stith Thompson's unflagging scholarship, his **Motif Index of Folk Literature** which tries to catalogue as in a lexicon or dictionary all the motifs of folktales from all over the world, whether written or oral. Unlike the **Tale Type Index,** which limits itself to the Folktales of Europe, West Asia, and the lands settled by these people, the **Motif Index** is much more pretentious: it attempts to cover all the regions of the globe.

There have appeared from members of the Finnish School excellent studies on particular folktales or motifs as these are found all over the world. To mention just a few, Anna Birgitta Rooth studied **The Cinderella Cycle** (Sweden, 1951), and again in 1962 **The Raven and Carcass: an Investigation of a Motif in the Deluge Myth in Europe, Asia and North America.**[14] Ake Hultkrantz in 1957 did a volume on **The North American Orpheus Tradition.**[15] The other studies include: Archer Taylor's **The Black Ox: a Study in the History of a Folktale** (Helsinki, 1927); Antti Aarne's **Die Magische Flucht:** eine Marchen-studie (Helsinki, 1940); Reidar Th. Christiansen, **The Migratory Legends: a Proposed List of Types with a Systematic Catalogue of the Norwegian Variants** (Helsinki, 1958).

Critique of the Finnish School

Scholarly studies undertaken by the Finnish historico-geographical school have enriched folkloristics with a profound and comprehensive view of the stores of folktales and of legends, as well as of their life in tradition. In this regard the works of Axel Olrik and Molke Mos have been of exeptional importance.[16]

---

[13] A doctoral thesis at the University of California, Los Angeles, 1965.

[14] Helsinki: Academia Scientiarum Fennica, 1962, with illustrations and bibliography, 268 pp.

[15] Stockholm: The Ethnographic Museum of Sweden, Monograph Series, Vol. 2.

[16] A. Olrik, "Epic Lawa of Folk Narrative," translated by Jeanne P. Steager from the German "Epic che Gesetze der Volksdrichtung," **Zeitschrift fur Deutsches Alter tun,** Vol. 51 (1909), pp. 1-12, and Molke Moe, **Episke Grundlove** (Kristiania, 1914).

But the Finnish Method has not been productive of deeper insights into the ultimate nature of the folktale and of folklore; nor has it prepared folklorists to enter into meaningful and constructive consortium with scholars from other disciplines except the litterateurs and the philologists. Yet, since the days of the British Anthropological School, hints were already seen of the possible linkage of folkloristics with other disciplines which study human behavior, since folktale telling was seen to be a very venerable and universal phenomenon or behavior. It is as universal as language and religion, and is found among the "primitives" as well as those far advanced on the road to culture and civilization. This lack of rapport with the behavioral sciences has been mainly due to the fact that "while the structural or pattern approach was sweeping through linguistics, psychology, enthnomusicology and anthropology proper in the 1920's and 30's folklore as a discipline remained oriented to a narrowly historical approach and dedicated to atomistic studies. In the thirties, the search for patterns was itself a pattern of culture. However, in the field of folklore, there was apparently no interest in a holistic synchronic approach. The major piece of folklore scholarship of the middle thirties was Stith Thompson's mammoth **Motif-Index of Folk Literature,** lexicon par excellence, epitome of the atomistic emphasis in folklore. The culture lag in folklore theory has unfortunately increased since the thirties and this is one reason why there have been so few notable theoretical advances in folklore[17].

Vagueness of Conceptual Tools for Analysis

The basic cause for the stunting of theoretical growth in folktale analysis was the failure of folklore scholars to evolve a unit of classification and analysis which may be uniformly applied to all the folk narratives of the world. The concept of motif and types, so well established among folklorists, was not understood on a fairly univocal sense by the scholars. No amount of listing and analysis of the motifs whose denotations were vague to scholars could have been relevant to the other progressive sciences of human behavior. For motif to some scholars meant "incident" or "element," whereas to Thompson it meant either actor, item or incident. Nor did they bother to determine the ultimate constituents of the folktale. Literally, there were as many opinions as there were heads. Boas in 1891 maintained that the constituents of the tale were incident and element; for Reichard (1921), in-

---

[17] Alan Dundes, "Structural Typology in North American Indian Folktales," **The Study of Folklore** (Englewood Cliffs: Prentice-Hall, Inc.), p. 207.

cident and episode; for Dubois and Demetracopoulou (1932), element and incident; for Luomala (1940), detail, incident and episode; for Reichard 20 years afterwards (1947), elment and episode. Finally in 1950, Wheeler-Vogelin taught that element and episode (or incident) made up the tale.

It is clear then that the nature of the units of the folktale was not adequately defined. The units remained vague, and no fine distinction was established between "elements" and "episodes." Thompson himself was at a loss to define clearly what the exact meaning of "motif" or "type" was. As is clear from his **tale-Type Index,** the largest number of traditional tales consist of only single-incident motifs. And Thompson himself admits that in the case of animal tales, "all, except about eight are single-motif tales or can be easily classified as such."[18] And Thompson admits that in such cases," type and motif are identical.[19]

Only recently, Thompson again admitted the vagueness of the limits of motif unit. He said: "I have found that perhaps the most difficult question ever asked me in connection with this Index is the leading question—what is a motif? To this there is no short and easy answer. Certain items in narrative keep on being used by story tellers; they are the stuff out of which tales are made. It makes no difference exactly what they are like. If they are actually useful in the construction of tales, they are considered to be motifs."[20] Nor is Thompson very clear either as to the precise definition of a folktale: "The term folktale, as used in English, is very inclusive. No attempt has ever been made to define it exactly, but it has been left as a general word referring to all kinds of traditional narrative...... Such a wide definition is a great convenience in English, since it avoids the necessity of making decisions and often of entering into long debates as to exact narrative genre to which a particular story may belong."[21] This failure to define basic terms and the apparent indifference to working with undefined terms seems to be characteristics of the older generation of folklorists.

Perhaps this imprecision is tolerable in historical and comparative

[18] Stith Thompson, "Purpose and Importance of an Index of Types and Motifs," **Folkliv,** Vol. 2 (1938), p. 106.

[19] Cf. Stith Thompson, Type," **Standard Dictionary of Folklore, Mythology, and Legend,** Vol. 2 (New York, 1950), p. 1137.

[20] Stith Thompson, "Narrative Motif-Analysis as a Folklore Method," **FFC,** No. 161 (Helsinki, 1955), p. 7.

[21] Stith Thompson, "Folktale," **Standard Dictionary of Folklore, Mythology and Legend,** Vol. 1, p. 408.

studies. But a vague unit like the motif cannot be the basis for a scientific study of the folktale.

Besides the vagueness of the motif as a basic unit of analysis, this methology also suffers from being atomistic. It breaks down the tales into motifs and tale-types. And there it stops. Despite von Sydow's counsel that "folktales must necessarily be studied not according to their types only, but above all by groups, so that the study of the individual type is connected with the study of all types belonging to the same natural group . . . . .," scholars of this School have not come up with a systematic device for viewing the folktales as wholes, but always as parts.

Lacking this solid empirical foundation for analysis, there was no possibility of grounding in reality the superstructure of theories about the nature and character of the folktale and of folklore. Because this method has been concerned mainly with the content of the folktale to the neglect of the form, there was no flexibility in passing from concrete analysis to more abstract statement. For content is labile and changeable, whereas form is dynamic and constant. Lacking a definition of its own proper identity, the discipline of the folktale could not enter into solid and lasting contacts with the other sciences which are oriented to form and structure.

Briefly, then, the following are on the credit side of the traditional method of analysis:

It has been able to establish, with varying degrees of approximation, the original text of a given tale abstracted from all its variants, both oral and written.

It salvaged for the coming generations a lot of the lore of the past which otherwise could have been lost forever, to the impoverishment of culture.

Through its atomistic method of isolating and classifying the labile or inconstant elements, through which the structure is manifested according to different cultural coloring, this method also made possible some insight into underlying structure or dynamic element of the folktale. Through the comparative method carried over a vast area, regularities and constants are liable to surface, thus making it possible to discover yet more profound and basic regularities based in structure.

On the debit side are the following:

It was vague in its terminology. It had no precise definition of

folktale, motif, plot, incident, element, episode, etc.

It was wanting in a definite structural unit of analysis.

Its approach was atomistic rather than holistic. Thus it could not consort meaningfully and fruitfully with other humane and social disciplines which were oriented to structure and morphology.

Part Two: The Structural School of Folklore Analysis (The Modern Method)

Brief Historical Overview

Roman Jakobson pointed out in 1929 that there was an analogy between language and folklore: "the languages of the whole world manifest a paucity and relative simplicity of structural types; and at the base of all these types lie universal laws. For recurrent character of linguistic patterns is paralleled by similar phenomena in the structure of folktales. If the structural types in language are few and relatively simple, then might we not also find in folktales a paucity and relative simplicity of structural types?"

Hans Honti, a Hungarian folklorist, saw that the traditional tale typology of European tales was not based on solid morphological criteria. Adolf Stender-Petersen in 1945 distinguished between what he termed the dynamic and labile elements of tales and legends. The dynamic elements are the invariable features of a legend (Propp's function), the labile or static elements are the specific variable actualizations or localizations found in a given version of a legend. Dynamic units are linked in logical-causal series. The labile elements are not. Claude Levi-Strauss, who wrote "The Structural Study of Myth," is to be credited as being the first to emphasize the necessity for a synchronic study of myth and for pointing out the importance not of the isolated elements or motifs which enter into the composition but the way these elements combine. For him the units of myth or folktales are "the gross constituent units." Even before these anthropologies, much older scholars had already pointed out the importance of pattern especially in the shaping of specific cultures. Margaret Mead averred that the idea of pattern was already by 1925 in wide use in anthropology; Ruth Benedict wrote her **Patterns of Culture** in 1934.

But despite the works of men like Roman Jakobson, Stender-Petersen, Levi-Strauss and Alan Dundes, the structural study of the folktale

would not have been started were if not for the Russian folklorist Vladimir Propp, who wrote in 1928 his **Morphology of the Folktale.** By folktale, however, Propp particularly meant the fairy tale, that is the type listed under Nos. 300-749 of Aarne Thompson's **Tale Types.**

Morphology is "the description of the folktale according to its component parts, and the relationship of these components to each other and to the whole." For Propp believes that after one has collected the folktale, the next step is to classify. But in order to classify one must first describe the folktale. But to do so, there must be a precise unit of judging—which ones are to be taken as folktales and which are not. Unlike the earlier scholars, whose basic unit of analysis was the vague concept of motif and plot or type, Propp devised a new basic unit, the function, which was essentially a unit of folktale plot action. The function is often defined by a noun expressing an action, such as Interdiction-Violation, Struggle-Victory, Deception, Pursuit, etc. His principal principles are:

(1) Functions serve as stable, constant elements in folktales, independent of who performs them, and how they are fulfilled by the dramatis personae. They constitute the components of the folktale.

(2) The number of these functions are limited (he discovered 31).

(3) The sequence of these 31 functions was fixed. Below, the 31 functions are enumerated.

The Stability of Functions

Functions are stable. The dramatis personae may be varied, but the functions remain the same. For instance, a folktale generally begins with the function of "absence" which is followed by an interdiction or a negative order or command. Who may be absent? They could be parents who leave for work, a prince out to hunt in the forest, a merchant out to trade in foreign lands. So absence may be: going to work, going to the forest, departing in order to trade, leaving for war, etc. But an intensified kind of absence could be the death of parents. Sometimes it is the younger set who absent themselevs: they ride or walk to someone as guests, like Little Red Riding Hood, or they go out to gather berries, or they leave to look for adventure, like Juan Pusong.

An interdiction is usually addressed to the hero. "You are not to open the box," (Pandora); you are not to look back at your bride before you reach the upper world (as in the case of Orpheus); you are not to say anything at all, however strong the provocation, etc.

It might be noted, too, that folktale presents a sudden emergence of misfortune which is usually already hinted at right at the beginning (members of family are enumerated, future hero is introduced in some manner, his name is revealed or status indicated). Though not necessarily a function, the initial situation is an important morphological element. For it sets the tone, so the speak, and allows the emergence of misfortune or villainy to begin.

Interdiction can be also a form of address to someone which can be an injunction (order or command): "Bring food to your brothers in the field," as in the case of Joseph and his brethren; "Take the child with you to the woods," as in the case of Oedipus Rex.

Again, Function No. 22: "Hero is rescued from Pursuit or Rescue," may be manifested in a number of ways: hero is carried away by an animal, he throws magic flight obstacles into the path of his pursuer like comb, or mirror which forms into water, or earth which forms into mountains, etc.; or by transforming himself into an object unrecognizable to his pursuer; or by means of a magic carpet, or a shield.

Paucity of Functions

For even as the structural components of language are relatively few, so also are the components of the folktale as Roman Jakobson had seen. There are only 31 functions, according to Propp. These 31 functions do not necessarily occur in any one given folktale. Nor are they of equal importance. The only obligatory function, according to Propp, is No. 8: "Villain causes harm or injury to one member of the family or Villainy." For it is this function, according to Propp, which creates the actual movement of the folktale.

A morphological equivalent to Villainy, according to Propp, is that of Function 8a: One member of a family lacks something, he desires to have something: a bride, he needs magical agents, or simply that the means of existence are insufficient." Thus either villainy or insufficiency can initiate a folktale's movement. Often a villainous act can create lack or need: heroine's eyes are plucked, a dragon kidnaps the king's daughter, a villain steals the daylight out, or a large dead fish lands on the shore, or a large stone falls from the sky upon the plaza, etc. Propp distinguishes between functions 8 and 8a: In the first instance(i.e., Villainy), a certain act is given, the result of which creates an insufficiency and provokes a quest; in the second, a ready-made insufficiency is presented, which provokes also a quest. In the first instance, a lack

is created from without; in the second it is realized from within."
Therefore "in those tales in which no villainy is present, a lack serves
as its counterpart."

For Propp the first seven functions are "the preparatory section of
the folktale." These functions prepare the way for the villainous act
or the state of insufficiency. However, all the seven functions are never
encountered in one folktale. The reason is that there are basically two
alternatives, consisting of paired functions. There are Functions 2 and
3 on the one hand: "The villain attempts to deceive his victim in order
to take possession of him or of his belongings" and "The victim submits
to deception and thereby unwittingly helps his enemy." Deceit and
Deception, as well as Interdiction-Violation, can lead to a villainous act
or a condition of insufficiency or lack. Thus, if one is found in a folktale,
the other pair may be unnecessary.

Sequence of These Functions

This brings us to the third principle of Propp's analysis. For there
are functions that go in pairs and where one is given, the other must
be there, either explicitly or impliedly. There are a number of these
paired functions: Struggle/Victory (16 and 17); Pursuit/Rescue (21
and 22); and probably the most important pair is: Villainy (Lack or Need)
and Liquidation of initial misfortune or lack (8 or 8a and 19). When
only one member of the pair appears, usually it is the second half of
the twin function. For instance, if Deception is present, then one can
understand that there has been deceit. But if Deceit is present, then
inevitably deception follows. If a violation is given (Pandora opens the
box), then it is understood that she had been interdicted from opening
it. Usually, if both functions of a pair are given, they appear in sequence.
The only exception to this rule is the twin function of Villainy/Lack
and its Liquidation. Propp hmself noted that "Villainy and its liquida-
tion are separated from each other by a long story." In fact the story
may be so long that what is found is not the same as what was lost. For
instance, Ivan sets out to look for his stead, and he comes home with a
wife. This separation between the halves of the fundamental pair of
functions 8/8a and 19 is an important point in comparing the structural
types of American folktales and the structure of Indo-European folktales.

In sum, then, the invaluable contribution of Propp to folklore
scholarship from a theoretical point of view is that "he more adequately
defined a unit of form, the function; he demonstrated the fixed nature

of the sequence of a number of his units in folktale; he showed how tales of apparently totally different content could in fact belong to an identical structural type, defined by statable morphological criteria."[22]

Pike and His Etic-Emic Units

Kenneth L. Pike considers language as verbal behavior which is a portion of human behavior in general. Since units, such as the phoneme, have been devised to describe verbal behavior, why may not we extend these units to include more of the gamut of human behavior? In his analysis of the four structural parts of the human meeting situation: greeting, request, reply, and sign off, he shows how gestures may fill a structural slot instead of words. Thus, he says: "language events and non-language events may constitute structurally equivalent members of classes of events which may constitute interchangeable parts within the larger unit events."[23] Pike distinguishes between the atomistic approach and the pattern or structural approach. He expresses this distinction by etic versus emic. The terms are from the last syllables of phon**etic** and phon**emic**.

The etic approach is non-structural and classificatory in that the analyst devices logical categories of systems, classes, and units without attempting to make them reflect actual structure in particular data. Etic constructs are created by the analysts and are not inherent in the material being studied. Etic systems are created specifically to handle cross-cultural or comparative data. The data in its context is not taken into consideration. Etic systems are the HRAF and the **Motif-Index.**

The emic approach is a structural one. Structural in that the analyst seeks to discover and "describe the pattern of a particular language or culture with respect to the way in which the various constituent elements are related to one another and to the pattern as a whole."

Pike says: "An emic approach must deal with particular events as parts of larger wholes to which they are related and from which they obtain their ultimate significance, whereas an etic approach may abstract events, for particular purposes, from their context or local system of events, in order to group them in a world-wide scale without essential references to any one language or culture."

Emic units within this theory are not absolutes in a vacuum, but

[22] Alan Dundes, **Morphology,** p. 51.
[23] **Ibid.,** p 55.

rather are points in a system, and these points are defined relative to the system. A point must be studied, not in isolation, but as part of a total functioning componential system within a total culture.

"The objection that a formulation deals with abstractions and not 'realities' is a vacuous one, because there is no such thing as a description of 'concrete reality.' No matter how minutely one were to describe a 'neuron' or the sequence of events associated with the interaction of neurons, one would not be describing 'reality' but only selecting certain aspects of it considered pertinent to the problem at hand, that is, abstracting. The question now, therefore, is whether abstractions are used in constructing theories from which other relations can be predicted. The verification of predictions implied in the theories is, of course, the test of their truth. But even if the predictions fail to be realized, the framework of the theory is often such that the way to refinement and correction becomes evident and thus progress in the search for truth can be realized."[24]

Pike's Structural Model

Pike gives three complex overlapping components of emic units. These components he calls modes. The three modes are: the feature mode, manifestation mode and distribution mode. Pike thus delineates a simultaneous trimodal structuring. Let us apply this to Propp's function.

As an emic unit, the function includes all three modes, but the overall generalized meaning of the function would correspond to the feature mode.

For instance, the feature mode of Function 8 would be "Villainy." The manifestation mode would consist of all the non-simultaneous-occuring physical variants of the function, like an enemy murders the father, a dragon kidnaps the princess, the stepmother maltreats Cinderella. In other words, the manifestation mode is the sum of all the different elements which can fulfill a given function. The distribution mode would consist of the positional characteristics of a particular function, that is, where among the 31 functions possible it occurs. Thus Function 8 may occur in initial position or after a number of functions from one to seven.

Propp certainly offered the discipline of folkloristics with the very useful structural unit of form for analysis, i.e., the function. But Propp

---

[24] Ibid., p. 58.

did not standardize any term for the elements which fulfill the functions, i.e., the constituents of the manifestation mode.

Pike labels the minimum unit of his feature mode as the **emic motif or motifeme.** This actually corresponds to Propp's function. So Dundes suggests that **motifeme** be used instead of Propp's function because it has not received approval in folkloristic circles. Then the term **allomotif** would be used for those motifs which occur in any given motifemic context.

The term **motifs,** already so well established in folklore scholarship, could be retained to refer to the elements fulfilling the motifemes, elements which Propp left nameless.

As we mentioned above, the dynamic elements in folktale are causally and functionally related, while the labile are not. So in terms of Dundes' proposal, we may say that there are structurally related sequences of motifemes, not of motifs.

Motifs in folktale are structurally related only in the that the motifemes which they manifest are so related. The structural sequence of motifemes is maintained regardless of the specific motifs which may manifest these motifemes. Thus the patterning of motifemes, not the patterning of motifs, should be the object of study.

Motifs as etic units are not under censure here. But only as structural unit of analysis. Motifs can be either item or actor. In a given motifeme, an actor or item might be interchanged freely. As a dramatis persona, an actor is not a structural unit of the folktale, but as an etic unit, he might occur in a motifeme. Etic systems, as we know, are utilitarian, classificatory systems which are not constructed with the idea of reflecting actual structure in data. Thus, in a dictionary, there may be several suffixes like 'ing' scattered throughout the book and listed alphabetically according to normal orthography. Etically, this is alright. But emically, the suffixes would be grouped differently, probably in groups based on functional similarities. Etically, there is no quarrel with the arrangement of the **Motif-Index.** But emically, or structurally speaking, quite diverse etic motifs might be grouped together.

The operative terms, then, for analysis are: **motifeme-allomotifs-motifs**

Motifeme, generally speaking, corresponds to Propp's Function.

Motifs are the elements, actors, items, which manifest the motifeme.

Before proceeding, it would be worthwhile, I think, to present to you in full the "functions" of Propp, or the "motifemes" as Dundes prefers to call them. I have tried to summarize these from Propp's Morphology.[25]

The Functions of Propp or the Motifemes

The Initial Situation. The members of the family are named, or the future hero is introduced one way or the other. His name and status are revealed. Although not a "function" itself, the Initial Situation is an important morphological element.

1. **Absence**: One of the members of a family is absent from home: to work, to hunt, to trade, to war. **Death** is an intensified form of absence on the part of parents.

2. **Interdiction**: An interdiction, or a negative injunction or command, is addressed to the hero. Folktale very often presents a sudden emergence of misfortune. This emergence is usually the outcome of an initial happy or prosperous state. For instance, "the king had a wonderful garden in which golden apples grew"; or "the old men fondly loved their Ivasecko," etc. Out of this situation of happiness or prosperity stems the interdiction. For instance, "do not pluck the fruits of the golden apples," or "on a particular day, do not fondle your Ivasecko," etc. An order often plays the role of an Interdiction. For instance, the children are urged to go out into the field or the forest.

3. **Violation**: The Interdiction is violated. Violation can sometimes exist without the Interdiction. "The princesses go into the garden; they are late in returning home." Interdiction against lateness is omitted.

At this point the Villain, the disturber of the peace of some family, who causes some harm or misfortune, enters.

4. **Reconnaissance**: The villain makes an attempt at Reconnaissance. His aim is to secure information about, say, where the children live, where the treasure is hidden, etc.

5. **Delivery**: The villain receives information about his victim. The delivery of the information may be spontaneously given to the villain in answer to his query, or it may be unwarily and carelessly supplied. "A woman calls her son home in a loud voice and thereby betrays his presence to the witch."

---

[25] **The Morphology of the Folktale,** (Indiana, 1928), pp. 24-59.

6. **Fraud:** The villain attempts to deceive his victim in order to take possession of him or his belongings. Villain usually puts on a disguise. Then the function follows: villain attempts persuasion, villain acts by application of magic means, e.g., sleeping potion.

7. **Complicity or Deception:** The victim submits to Deception and thereby unwittingly helps the enemy. Hero agrees to the villain's persuasions. Note that Interdictions are **always broken,** and deceitful proposals are **always accepted** and **fulfilled**.

The hero mechanically reacts to the use of magical potions and he sleeps. It is also possible for Complicity to exist **without** previous deception. Hero falls asleep by himself in order, of course, to render easy the villain's tricks.

Deceitful agreement constitutes a special form of deceitful proposal and assent. Assent here is compelled because the villain takes advantage of a bad situation in which the victim is caught: shipwrecked, extreme poverty, etc. At times, the villain produces the very same hardships for the hero, e.g., a bear seizes the king by the beard. This may be called "initial misfortune."

8. **Villainy:** The villain causes harm or injury to one member of a family. This is a very important function. Because of it the actual movement of the folktale is created. Absence, violation of interdiction, delivery of information, success of a deceit—all are mere preparation in a folktale. The plot begins with an act of villainy. The forms of villainy are extremely varied.

8a. **Lack:** One member of a family lacks something, he desires to have something. Many folktales do not begin with a misfortune, but with a lack, or with a state of surplus. The tale of Emel, the fool, begins with the fool's catching a pike, not with villainy. Generally, the elements Villainy and Lack are required for each folktale of the class being studied. "Other forms of initial plot do not exist."

9. **Mediation** or the **Connective Moment:** Misfortune or shortage is made known: the hero is either approached with a request and responds to it of his own accord, or is commanded and dispatched. Propp distinguishes between the two types of folktale heroes: 1) the Seeker-hero and the 2) Victim hero. In the second type, the thread of the narrative is linked to the facts of a kidnapped boy or girl and not to those who remain behind.

10. **Counteraction:** The seeker agrees to, or decides upon, counter-

action. This function is true only of folktales whose heroes are of the seeker-type. Banished, vanquished, bewitched and substituted heroes show no volitional aspiration toward freedom. Therefore, in their case, there is no element of decision or agreement.

11. **Departure:** The hero leaves home. This departure is something different from temporary absence as we have in Function 2. The departures of the seeker- and the victim-heroes are varied. The seeker is in search for his goal. The victim travels along a route where no search is involved, but which rather prepares a series of adventures for him. If a girl is abducted and a hero goes in pursuit of her, then two have left home. But the route followed by the story and the focus of the action is actually the route of the seeker.

In the case of seekers, a new character enters: the "donor" or the "provider." He is usually come upon by **accident**. From him the seeker obtains some means (usually magical) to finally liquidate the misfortune. Before this, however, the hero will undergo a number of adventures which will eventually bring him to the possession of the magical agent.

12. **First Function of Donor:** Hero is tested, interrogated, attacked, etc, in preparation for receiving either a magical agent or a magic helper.

13. **Hero's Reaction:** The hero reacts to the actions of the future donor. In many folktales, the reaction of the hero is either clearly positive or clearly negative.

14. **The Provision, Receipt of Magical Agent:** A magic agent is at the disposal of the hero. Magical agents can be any of the following: 1. Animals (horse, or eagle, etc); 2. Objects out of which helpers appear; 3. Objects possessing a magical property, such as cudgels, swords, fiusla, balls, etc; 4. Qualities or capacities which are directly given (theriomorphism, etc). All of these objects of transmission are conditionally termed magical. As soon as a magical agent is received, it is employed at once. Outwardly, after this, the hero becomes "useless" since the helper performs everything. Yet the significance of the hero, morphologically speaking, is still very great. For it is his intentions which create the pivot on which the narrative is based. These intentions are expressed in the various commands which the hero gives to his helpers.

Propp then digresses and gives a definition of a hero in fairytale. "The hero of a fairytale is that character who either directly suffers from the action in the initial plot of the villain or who agrees to liquidate some misfortune or shortage of another person. In the process of the

action, the hero is the person who is supplied with a magical agent (a magical helper), and who makes use of it."

15. **Spatial Translocation Between Two Kingdoms, Guidance:** The hero is transferred, reaches, or is led to the whereabouts of an object of search. **Delivery,** or Function 5, is often eliminated. The hero simply walks to some spot or other. In other words, Function 15, or Spatial Translocation, amounts to a natural continuation of Function 11: **Departure**.

16. **Struggle:** The hero and the villain join in direct combat. This function must be distinguished from the struggle (hand-to-hand skirmish) with a villainous donor. The norm for distinction is the effect they produce. If the hero obtains an agent, for the purpose of further seeking, as a result of combat with a villainous character, this would be Function No. 12. First Function of Donor: to test, attack, interrogate hero. Function No. 16, Struggle, would be present if the hero were to receive, as a result of struggle, the very object of quest for which he was dispatched.

17. **Branding, Marking:** The hero is branded. His body is tattooed, is wounded, is kissed with a mark imprinted on his cheek, receives a ring or towel.

18. **Victory:** The villain is defeated. Victory can also be attained in a negative way. Of two or three heroes who have assembled for combat, one hides, while the other is victorious.

19. **Liquidation of Lack or Initial Misfortune:** This function, together with No. 8 **(Villainy),** constitutes a pair. The narrative reaches its peak in this function.

20. **Return:** The hero returns. A **Return** often has the character of a flight from someone or something.

21. **Pursuit, Chase:** The hero is pursued.

22. **Rescue:** The hero is rescued from pursuit. Many folktales end on the note of rescue from pursuit. Hero arrives home and subsequently, marriage. However, often another misfortune is in store for the hero. An initial villainy is repeated, either in the same form as at the start of the tale, or as sometimes happens, in a different form. With this a new story commences.

Many folktales, then, are composed of two kinds of functions which may be labelled "moves." A new villainous act creates a new story.

23. **Unrecognized Arrival:** The hero, unrecognized, arrives home or in another country. There are two classes of **Unrecognized Arrivals:** 1. Arrival at home where a hero stays with some sort of artisan (goldsmith, tailor, shoemaker) ; 2. He arrives either as a cook, groom. Sometimes it is necessary to single out and designate even a simple arrival.

24. **Difficult Task:** A difficult task is proposed to the hero. This is one of folktale's favorite elements. Tasks are varied.

25. **Solution:** The task is accomplished. Forms of accomplishment correspond to the forms of tasks.

26. **Recognition:** The hero is recognized. He is recognized by the brand, the sear, or by a ring or towel, etc. In this case **Recognition** is a function which corresponds to No. 17 (**Branding or Marking**).

27. **Exposure:** The false hero is exposed.

28. **Transfiguration:** The hero is given a new appearance.

29. **Punishment:** The villain is punished.

30. **Wedding:** The hero is married and ascends the throne.

Part Three: Specimens of Folktale Analysis: The Historico- Genetical Method

What follows is a synopsis of Stith Thompsom's analysis of the "Star Husband Tale."[26] The method, in brief, is as follows:

1. Thompson located and collected as many versions as possible, of the "Star Husband Tale," which he arranged by culture and areas, moving from the western United States to the eastern.

2. Next he inspects the corpus of texts closely, then breaks them into principal traits. These traits show some variations. By means of the variations of the content of the traits, it is possible to distinguish smaller groups of versions sharing a particular subtrait.

3. Then the hypothetical archetype is established by individually looking at each trait in order to determine what was the probable archetypal form of a given trait. The folklorist takes into account such factors as early recording, literary versions, and widespread or minimal distribution.

[26] Cf. Dundes, **The Study of the Folktale.**

4. As soon as the archetype for each individual trait has been determined the list of archetypal traits is put together into a running narrative, and this is considered to be the possible basic type or archetype of the entire tale. The hypothetical archetype is, of course, only an abstraction from the many versions, and may or may not coincide with even one of the versions actually recorded in the original corpus.

As Alan Dundes remarks, this method is important in determining whether and how a particular informant has varied a tale. Yet further questions remain to be answered: Why did the archetype, assuming it is a valid reconstruction, arise in the first place? Why did subtypes evolve and why did they evolve precisely where they did? Why is a tale in its many forms continually told or why did it cease to be told? To answer these questions, no one approach is sufficient. One should call upon other approaches. The tracing of historical origins and of paths of diffusion are a part of this discipline. The study of psychological origins and of function is also part of it.

Traits of the Tale

a. Number of women, b. Introductory action, c. Circumstances of introductory action, d. Method of ascent, e. Identify of husband. f. Distinctive qualities of husband, g. Birth of son, h. Taboo broken in upper world, i. Discovery of skyhole, j. Assistance in descent, k. Means of descent, l. Result of descent, m. Explanatory element, n. Sequel.

Cultural Areas

Eskimo, Mackenzie, North Pacific Area, California Area, Plateau Area, Plains Area, Southeast Area, Woodland Area.

Analysis of the Principal Traits

a. **Number of women:** One or two; or two at beginning, then only one; three, five.

b. **Introductory action:** Wish for star husband; Pursuit of porcupine; Sun and moon dispute about women and decide to get earth and water wives; Miscellaneous: girls carried to sky-world by supernatural beings; Elopement; Girls run away to sky world.

c. **Circumstances of introductory action** (What girls were doing when

action begins): Sleeping (lying) in open at night, Sleeping on an arbor, Stars seen through roof, Performing tasks: digging roots, gathering wood, etc.

d. **Method of ascent:** Not indicated, Stretching tree (warning from friend), Translation during sleep, Carried through air with closed eyes, Carried through air by hair, Carried in a basket, Transportation in whirlwind, Transportation by feather.

e. **Indentity of husband:** Not indicated, Moon, Moon and Sun, Thunder, Porcupine, Man, Whirlwind.

f. **Distinctive qualities of husband:** None, Old Man, Young Man, Middle-aged man (Old man's eye water, and young man's war paint), Two men with different colored bankets, Red Star Sun and White Star Moon, Dim Star Chief, Bright Star His Servant, One-Sided Man, Hunters.

g. **Birth of son:** No, yes

h. **Taboo broken in Upper World:** No taboo broken, Digging or disturbing ground, Digging roots of various kinds, Moving large rocks, digging in valleys, looking and shooting at meadow lark, Making noise before squirrel or chickadee sings.

i. **Discovery of skyhole:** Trait not present, by own efforts, at another's suggestion, with another's assistance.

j. **Assistance in descent:** Lacking, Spider (Spiderwoman, Spiderman), Old Woman, Old Man, Husband, Sister of Star, Buzzard, Hawk, Eagle.

k. **Means of descent:** No descent, Descent by means not specified, Basket, Rope (Skin rope, sinew rope, wool rope, spider rope, root rope, grass rope, weed rope, bark rope), ladder, bucket, falling, descent with taboo, looking taboo, stirring taboo.

Results of descent: Lacking, safe descent, later killed, woman (women) killed, woman killed, later revived, woman killed, son saved, one woman falls.

Explanatory elements: No explanations, heavenly bodies, moon and stars, geographical features, vegetable and animal features (origin of turnips, origin of animals, animal markings, bodily shape of animal, blindness of animal), human society (sun dance ceremony, backward state of the Indian), personal characteristics (time for human gestation, why young women dislike old husbands), medicine (treatment of wound), miscellaneous explanations (origin of taboo, painting of lodges).

Sequel: No sequel, Plains Star Boy Sequel (boy becomes transformed), trickster animals under tree, Sky War Sequel, Origin Myth Sequel, Buffalo Husband Sequel, Return of Sky Sequel.

Construction of Basic Type and Subtypes

Type I: Basic Tale Archetype

Two girls (65 per cent) sleeping out (85) make wishes for stars as husbands (90). They are taken to the sky in their sleep (82) find themselves married to stars (87), a young man and an old man, corresponding to the brilliance or size of stars (55). The women disregard the warning not to dig (90) and accidentally open up a hole in the sky (76). Unaided (52), they descend on a rope (88) and arrive home safely (76).

Type II: Porcupine Redaction (Subtype)

A girl (100), while performing a task (84), follows a porcupine (95) up a tree which stretches to the upper world (95). The porcupine becomes the moon (45), the sun (25), or a star (15) in the form of a young man (30). The girl marries him and bears a son (95). She is warned not to dig (80) but disobeys and discovers a skyhole (85). By her own efforts (45) or by the help of her husband (25), she descends on a sinew rope (85), but it is too short. The husband sends down a rock with instructions to kill the wife and spare the son (85). Sequel: The adventures of Star Boy (Moon Boy or Sun Boy) (90).

Other types are: Type III: Animal Trickster Under Tree, Type IV: Origin of the Transformer, and Type V: The Sky War.

The following tales are shortened versions of the originals. They are given here to highlight the functions found in them.

Tale 1. When Aguio was a little boy he refused to let his father fondle him **(Injunction/Non-fulfillment=Interdiction/Violation).** So his father drove him from home **(Consequence).** He wandered about and became a famous hero **(Departure).** Finally, he was killed by his brother whom he did not know **(Deceit/Deception-Villainy).** His wife chewed tina-lad* and spat on him **(Helper)** and he became alive again **(Attempted Escape).**[27]

> Injunction/Non-fulfillment=Interdiction/Violation, Consequence, Departure, Deceit/Deception, Villainy, Helper/Attempted Escape.

---

[27] Cole, **The Bukidnon,** p. 131.

Sequel: No sequel, Plains Star Boy Sequel (boy becomes transformed), trickster animals under tree, Sky War Sequel, Origin Myth Sequel, Buffalo Husband Sequel, Return of Sky Sequel.

Construction of Basic Type and Subtypes

Type I: Basic Tale Archetype

Two girls (65 per cent) sleeping out (85) make wishes for stars as husbands (90). They are taken to the sky in their sleep (82) find themselves married to stars (87), a young man and an old man, corresponding to the brilliance or size of stars (55). The women disregard the warning not to dig (90) and accidentally open up a hole in the sky (76). Unaided (52), they descend on a rope (88) and arrive home safely (76).

Type II: Porcupine Redaction (Subtype)

A girl (100), while performing a task (84), follows a porcupine (95) up a tree which stretches to the upper world (95). The porcupine becomes the moon (45), the sun (25), or a star (15) in the form of a young man (30). The girl marries him and bears a son (95). She is warned not to dig (80) but disobeys and discovers a skyhole (85). By her own efforts (45) or by the help of her husband (25), she descends on a sinew rope (85), but it is too short. The husband sends down a rock with instructions to kill the wife and spare the son (85). Sequel: The adventures of Star Boy (Moon Boy or Sun Boy) (90).

Other types are: Type III: Animal Trickster Under Tree, Type IV: Origin of the Transformer, and Type V: The Sky War.

The following tales are shortened versions of the originals. They are given here to highlight the functions found in them.

Tale 1.   When Aguio was a little boy he refused to let his father fondle him (**Injunction/Non-fulfillment=Interdiction/Violation**). So his father drove him from home (**Consequence**). He wandered about and became a famous hero (**Departure**). Finally, he was killed by his brother whom he did not know (**Deceit/Deception-Villainy**). His wife chewed tinalad* and spat on him (**Helper**) and he became alive again (**Attempted Escape**).[27]

> **Injunction/Non-fulfillment=Interdiction/Violation, Consequence, Departure, Deceit/Deception, Villainy, Helper/Attempted Escape.**

---

[27] Cole, **The Bukidnon**, p. 131.

Tale 2. Aguio once went to another land **(Absence)**. When he had travelled several years he found himself out of provisions **(Lack)**. To add to his trouble his enemies had united to defeat him. They wished to raid his town and to make the children slaves after the men were dead **(Trebling)**. He met his enemies and in several hours of fighting **(Struggle)** succeeded in killing many of them **(Victory, also Lack Liquidated)**. But in the end he was so exhausted **(Lack)** he would have been killed had his brothers **(Helpers)** not come to his aid **(Rescue)** and turn defeat to victory **(Attempted Escape/Lack Liquidated/Victory)**.[28]

> **Absence, Lack (trebling of lack), Struggle/Victory=Lack Liquidation, Lack, Rescue, Attempted Escape=Lack Liquidation=Victory.**

Tale 3. Adam and Eve. The Magbabaya made Adam and Eve and put them in the world. Soon they had a son and they did not want him **(Violation=Non-fulfillment)**. They slew him and burned his body in the fire **(Villainy)**. A second son was born, and they killed him also and threw him into the river **(Violence=Non-fulfillment, and Villainy)**. Not long after the Magbabaya came, and when he found **(Mediation)** what they had done he was very angry **(Consequence)**. He gathered up the bones **(Helper)** and made them alive again **(Attempted Escape-Resuscitation)**. The first boy went far away **(Departure)** and became "the holder of the smallpox" **(Transformation)**. Sometimes he returns to visit his brothers **(Return)** and great sickness follows **(Explanatory Motif=Punishment)**. Magbabaya asked the second boy if he wished to live with his parents again **(Interrogation)**, but he said no, for they wished to kill him **(Motive for not returning)**. So he chose to live in the water **(Departure)** and became the spirit Bulalakau **(Transformation)**. Sometimes he visits his brothers **(Return)** and then someone is drowned **(Explanatory Motif=Punishment)**.[29]

> **Interdiction/Violation = Injunction/Non-fulfillment, Villainy, Interdiction/Violation = Injunction/Non-fulfillment, Villainy (Doubling?), Mediation, Consequence, Helper/Attempted Escape = Resuscitation, Departure, Transformation, Return, Explanatory Motif = Punishment, Interrogation (motive for not returning), Departure, Transformation, Return, Explanatory Motif = Punishment.**

---

[28] **Loc. cit.**

[29] **Ibid.,** p. 128.

Tale 4. How Pilandok Became a Sultan. Pilandok, by order of the sultan, is placed inside a cage and thrown into the sea (**Villainy**). Miraculously he escapes death (**Rescue and Attempted Escape**). Pilandok dresses himself as a rajah, seeks the presence of the sultan and recounts a false story of his rescue: his rich ancestors in the bottom of the sea released him from cage, welcomed him and gave him much treasure. He is returning to them very soon (**Deceit**). The sultan believes the story of Pilandok and asks to be allowed to accompany Pilandok on his return there (**Deception**).

Pilandok remonstrated that his ancestors are expecting his return soon. However, he is quite willing to defer it in favor of the sultan's going there first (**Deceit again and Trebling**). The sultan issues an edict appointing Pilandok his successor until his return (**Deception**). Everyone bows to Pilandok in the sultan's presence (**Deception:doubled**). Pilandok takes a heavy iron cage, places the sultan in it, and pushes him into the sea from a high promontory (**Villainy=Punishment**). Pilandok remains the sultan (**Reward**).[30]

Villainy, Rescue = Attempted Escape, Deceit / Deception, Deceit / Deception (trebling), Deception (doubling), Villainy = Punishment, Reward.

Tale 5. Manik Buangsi—A Samal Story. A sultan had seven beautiful daughters. He married off six. The youngest would not marry despite the wishes of her father (**Injunction-Non-fulfillment = Interdiction / Violation**). She had fallen in love with Manik Buangsi, a supernatural youth whom she saw in her dream (**Motive for Violation**). Manik Buangsi, through a rift in the heavenly floor, had seen the beautiful Tuan Putli, had fallen in love with her, in her sleep, and would marry no one else but her (**Lack**). Both were lovesick and sought God's help (**Continuing Lack and Request**). God allowed Manik Buangsi to visit his beloved on earth for a while.

An old woman asked some alms from Tuan Putli (**Donor and Test**). Tuan gave her alms (**Task Accomplished**). As a return for her goodness, the beggar woman gave her a guava-like fruit (**Magic Object**). She was told to plant it (**Injunction**). She did (**Task Accomplished**). The plant grew and bore fruit overnight. The next day, Tuan Putli plucked the most beautiful of its fruit and brought it inside her room. At night, it

---

[30] Delia Coronel, "Stories and Legends from Filipino Folknore," **Unitas**, Vol. 39 (December, 1966).

filled her room with light. At midnight, the fruit opened and Manik
Buangsi came out and beheld his beautiful love (Lack Liquidation). But
at the break of dawn, he reentered the fruit and became enchanted again
(Injunction understood/ Fulfillment). Thus it happened for a number of
nights. One night after midnight, he forgot to return inside the fruit at
dawn because he had fallen asleep contemplating the beauty of his
beloved (Violation). Tuan Putli awoke and saw the beautiful face of her
lover (Lack Liquidated-Recognition). A royal wedding followed with so
much royal gifts (Wedding).

The sisters of Tuan Putli were envious of her good fortune and
sought to spoil the love of the two lovers (Villainy). They said that Manik
Buangsi was the devil incarnate, that he had been with other women
before he married Tuan (Deceit). Tuan Putli at first did not believe them.
But gradually she began to suspect Manik Buangsi and finally hated him
(Deception). Deeply hurt, Manik decided to return to heaven (Con-
sequence) upon a white horse (Magic Object). At last repentant, Tuan
Putli requested Manik to allow her to ride away with him to heaven
(Attempted Escape). As they fled many obstacles came their way (Test)
which they successfully overcame (Tests Accomplished). Until finally
they came to a long narrow bridge (Spatial Translocation) which they had
to cross (Difficult Task). Below was the river of the condemned. Manik
Buangsi told Tuan to keep silent at all cost and not to look back or down
(Interdiction). She promised to comply. As they were crossing, Tuan heard
a voice like that of her dead mother calling out to her. She looked down
(Violation) and a burning wind dragged her down (Consequence).[31]

I. Injunction / Non-fulfillment = Interdiction / Violation
(Motive), Lack, Lack (request), Donor and Test / Test Ac-
complished, Magic Object, Injunction / Task Accomplished,
Lack Liquidated, Injunction / Non-fulfillment = Interdic-
tion / Violation, Lack Liquidated = Recognition, Wedding.

II. Villainy, Deceit / Deception, Consequence, Magic Object,
Attempted Escape, Tests / Tests Accomplished, Spatial
Translocation, Difficult Task, Violation, Consequence.

---

31 Ibid., pp. 513-516.

Part Four: Suggestions Towards a Scientific Analysis of Filipino Tales

General Remarks

It is quite clear that both the traditional and the modern methods of analysis have their own distinct advantages. The advantages of the structural approach may be further specified:

1. Gains for the solution of typology. In linguistics and the study of rituals, scholars have discovered the existence of content-cognates as well as structure-cognates. Through the structure analysis, the folklorists will be able to discover structural patterns in folktales as well as in folklore.

2. Once the patterns are established, the scholar might be able to predict with some exactness the combination of motifemes that will occur. Thus, trickster sees a man with an arrow that could kill any game. Trickster wants the arrow (Lack), the man gives him the arrow (Lack Liquidation). After a limited number of successes, the arrow fails to perform (Consequence). This is a case of what Dundes calls a nuclear motifemic sequence. (Lack / Lack Liquidation understood / Violation, Consequence).

Once this type of sequence is grasped, the scholar can predict with a good degree of exactness this type of sequence.

3. By understanding the mechanics of variations between Asiatic and American Indian and European tales, for instance, we see how the original European tale has became acculturated in a North American Indian tale through the following examples: European: Some wolves resolve to capture someone on top of a tree. They climb on top of one another. When the lowest one runs off, the others fall. The American Indian tale runs like this: Coyote gathers other coyotes to ascend a cliff by holding on to corn cobs inserted into their anuses. They are told not to break wind (Interdiction). The last coyote breaks wind (Violation) the chain tumbles down (Consequence).

We might be able to predict the acculturation such a tale, if any, may assume in the Philippines. We can be sure that monkeys will feature in this tale, that their tails may be the important part of their anatomy concerned, that an interdiction against scratching one's back, or picking the lice on another's head, will be violated, etc. Through structural analysis the folklorist will be able to appreciate the variations due to

cultural preferences, and thus be better able to account for the many variations in content cognates.

4. By means of structural analysis one can study the cultural content of transcultural forms. Thus one might discover the amazing uniformity of the **Injunction/Violation** pair of motifemes in a great number of different tales from one people or from a group of peoples.

Then, too, one is enabled to analyze the other forms of folklore in terms of structure or form, and perhaps a deeper appreciation of the major themes and patterns that run through a particular culture or group of cultures will come about. Dundes, for instance, has discovered great similarity between the structure of the north American Indian tales and their folk beliefs. For instance, in a folktale, a girl is warned not to hunt rabbits **(Intrediction)**. She does **(Violation)**. A cannibalistic monster appears **(Consequence)**. The twin Ahaiyute save her **(Attempted Escape)**. The structure of a folk belief runs like this: If a woman eats wafer bread from hunt **(Condition)**, she will bear twins **(Result)** unless the bread is passed around the rung of her house ladder four times **(Counteractant)**. In the superstition or folk belief, the **Condition and Resultant** correspond to the folktale's **Interdiction/Consequence**. The **Counteractant** serves as the counterpart of **Attempted Escape.**

As for the benefits we have derived from the genetico-historical method, I simply have to remind you again of the painstaking and meticulous service it has done all of us in locating, collecting and arranging a vast corpus of traditional lore which would otherwise have been lost. Boldly it has reconstructed the original type of the tales which have come down to us in a welter of variants. It has, therefore, solved at least in part the problem of the historical origins of the folktales. And by methodical analysis it has tried to retrace the paths covered by the various tales as they became diffused all over the world. These are no mean contributions to our body of knowledge.

Specific Suggestions: Specialized Collecting

Concretely, however, how may we go about addressing ourselves to the vast corpus of folktales in our archives and libraries, both public and private? First of all, we have to continue locating and collecting our folktales either from written or from oral sources.

But we must begin to collect with better discernment. We must

put a moratorium on the so-called "dragnet" method, whereby we collect all and sundry tales we come upon. Rather, let those of us who have an interest in this science get together and plan a system of collecting aimed at only one or at most two kinds of folktales.

For instance, the scholars at Silliman could specialize in collecting wild animal tales and fables. These are cognate types and those out to collect these two types will have enough work to do. We, at Xavier University, could specialize, say, in ordinary tales. This is a vast field to cover, and we could split it with some other institution. The scholars at the University of San Carlos could collect jokes and anecdotes. Notre Dame of Jolo might want to specialize in formula tales.

The above division of labor is based on the traditional way of classifying the folktale as given by Thompson in his **Types of the Folktales.** Another plan for specialized collection, based on other methods of classification like that of Von Sydow or Lauri Honko, might also be used. We can, for instance, assign for specialized collecting to various scholars the following classes: folk beliefs, memorates (actual personal experience of the supernatural), fabulates (i.e., legends which are oftentimes migratory and are characterized by "their drastic fantasy motifs and their narrative value", their humor, and their exciting nature); local belief legend (proper only to a limited area), belief legends (generally international migratory), enterainment legends, migratory legends, folktale, ficts (pedagogical devices) employed by the elders to keep the youngsters in control), metaphor, charm, prayer or description of a rite, and finally, myth. We can further subdivide the folktale as well as the myth.

This specialized manner of collecting will ensure that the whole gamut of the folktale or folk narrative will be covered through concerted effort.

Collecting of Specific Tale Type

Nor is that all. We must also begin to assign the task of collecting tales with their variants. For instance, within a university, we might assign some of our better trained students to collect all the variants he can lay hands on of the tale of the "Monkey and the Turtle," or the "Tale of the Two Brothers," or "The Tar-Baby Tale," or "The Star Husband Tale," or "The One-Sided Man Tale," or "Juan Pusong Tale."

In this way, we can prepare ourselves for the further task of ana-

lysis in depth of these various tales both as to form and content, or as to structure and content. Or, if the field of specialized collecting happens to be the myth, we might assign students with sufficient initiative and training to gather all the variants of myths about "Creation of the World," or "Creation of Man and Woman," or the "Flood-Myth," or the "Myths of Death," and so on.

Needless to say, this requires a good deal of organization and coordination. To achieve this, various scholars should come together for a couple of days with a previously agreed upon agenda, under the lead of experts (Manuel for epics, Ramos for creatures of lower mythology, Eugenio on the Proverbs, Donn Hart on the riddles, Demetrio on folk beliefs and the folktales, Rixon on myth, Brien on legends, etc.). The purpose is to inspire and instruct other collaborators who will actively participate in the task of specialized collecting.

With collections highly specialized, the next step would be to decide on the manner of analysis. It would be possible, I think, to assign for analysis the same genre or type of folktale to the same people who took care of collecting them. I also believe that both the methods of the genetico-historical school and that of the structural or functional school must be employed. With the analysis of the motifs and the plot-types as proposed and employed by Antti Aarne and Stith Thompson, we should also employ the methology of Propp as further elaborated by Alan Dundes and others. This will, of course, require more than one meeting. And, finally, we must make the fruits of our work available to international and national scholars by publishing them. Perhaps a board of editors will have to be formed for this task. But this is going ahead too far of ourselves.

Mechanics of Recording and Storing

I would rather dwell now on the more concrete mechanics of folktale collecting, recording and classification.

First of all, there is need of supplying every single tale we have with an English title as well as with an English synopsis, whether the tale be long or short. The English title and the English precis are important. First, they will help later on in making the schema for the plot-types after the manner of Antti-Thompson. Second, they will help in the analysis of motifs, although not in great detail. For the synopsis will almost invariably contain the more important motifs of the tale. Third, not all are capable of going through the entire text for lack of know-

ledge in the dialect (should it be in the dialect), or for lack of time (should the text be jotted down originally in English). And the short but adequate synopsis may be the precise thing to excite or interest this particular reader to go more deeply into folkloristics, or at least to make use of it in his chosen field of endeavor. Fourth, if we must not isolate our scholarship but make it relevant to world scholarship, we have to make our own traditions known to the international scholars in a language that is generally used by them, namely, English.

Then, every single tale told in any of the dialects should be accompanied not only with an English synopsis. It must, as far as possible, also be translated into idiomatic English. And this for reasons already given above.

There is need also of questionnaires to be administered by local collectors in the local dialects or in English. Since many of the people in the provinces do not have a good command of English, my advice is to use the vernacular in these questionnaires. There are samples of these which my own staffers have found useful in collecting folktales and other folklore materials.

Finally there is need for a systematic method of recording the folktales or folk beliefs in our archives.